

ISRAEL

STUDIES IN ZIONISM AND THE STATE OF ISRAEL
HISTORY, SOCIETY, CULTURE

The Chaim Weizmann Institute for the Study of Zionism and Israel was set up in 1962 at Tel Aviv University through the initiative and with the assistance of the Executive of the World Zionist Organization, with the aim of furthering the research and the teaching of the history of the Zionist idea, the Zionist movement and the Land of Israel in modern times.

ISRAEL

STUDIES IN ZIONISM AND THE STATE OF ISRAEL
HISTORY, SOCIETY, CULTURE

No. 23, 2016

Special Issue **Hashomer Hatza'ir**

Guest Editors

Alon Gan, Aviva Halamish



THE CHAIM ROSENBERG SCHOOL OF JEWISH STUDIES
THE CHAIM WEIZMANN INSTITUTE FOR THE STUDY OF ZIONISM AND ISRAEL

Editor: Rona Yona

Editorial Board: Avi Bareli, Nurith Gertz, Avner Horowitz,
Hannah Naveh, Shalom Ratzabi, David Tal

Style Editing: Herzlia Efrati
English Editing: Philippa Shimrat

Front cover:
Avraham Omri, *Olive Harvest*, 1945, oil on wood, 77×57,
courtesy of Yad Yaari

Back cover:
Yaakov Guterman, watercolor painting,
courtesy of Yaakov Guterman

© 2016

All Rights Reserved

Tel Aviv University

The Chaim Weizmann Institute for the Study of Zionism and Israel

Graphic Editing: Michal Semo and Yael Bieber, TAU Graphic Design Studio

Printed in Israel by Cordoba Print

CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION

Hashomer Hatza'ir in Historical Perspective Aviva Halamish and Alon Gan.....	1
--	---

ARTICLES

The Current State of Research on Hashomer Hatza'ir Izhar Ben-Nahum.....	9
---	---

THE EDUCATIONAL MOVEMENT

The Educational Method of Hashomer Hatza'ir in the Youth Movement and Formal Education Yuval Dror.....	31
--	----

Between Faith and Doubt, West and East: The Hashomer Hatza'ir Youth Movement's Identification with the Soviet Union in the 1950s and 1960s Ronit Carmeli.....	63
---	----

Martin Buber and Hashomer Hatza'ir Muki Tsur.....	83
---	----

FACING THE HOLOCAUST

Voices from Afar: Emissaries from Palestine to the Polish Hashomer Hatza'ir Eli Tzur	103
--	-----

What Did We Talk about during the War? Revelation and Concealment in the Discourse of the German Youth Group in Kibbutz Ma'abarot Einat Nachmias	133
--	-----

"Tashkent the City of Bread": The Polish Hashomer Hatza'ir in Central Asia, 1941-1945 Ruth Braude	157
---	-----

Two Avant-Garde Concepts: Hashomer Hatza'ir in Poland and in Hungary during the Holocaust Avihu Ronen	183
---	-----

HAKIBBUTZ HA'ARTZI

Hakibbutz Ha'artzi in the First Decade of the State of Israel: Between Fulfilling a Mission and Building a Home

Alon Pauker and Tamar Shechter.....205

“Everything will be returned to its place”: Hakibbutz Ha'artzi and the Reparations Agreement

Ofer Boord233

The Legacy of the Hashomer Hatza'ir Youth Movement in Hakibbutz Ha'artzi and Mapam

Tal Elmaliach259

CULTURE AND LITERATURE

Literature as an Ideological Tool: The Case for Socialist Realism in the Hashomer Hatza'ir Weekly, 1931-1943

Shula Keshet287

The Avant-Garde of the Young Guard: Two Competing Pioneering Models in Hashomer Hatza'ir Children's Literature

Yael Darr315

Communal Singing and Repertoire in Hashomer Hatza'ir

Natan Shahar333

List of Contributors335

English Summaries VII

Abstracts

Izhar Ben-Nahum

The Current State of Research on Hashomer Hatza'ir

The term Hashomer Hatza'ir has three meanings: it can refer to the youth movement, the political organization or the kibbutz federation. Some researchers have chosen to treat the three bodies as one, especially when dealing with ideological views, such as Hashomer Hatza'ir's attitude towards socialism and the Soviet Union or the idea of a binational state, etc. Most books about the Hashomer Hatza'ir youth movement focus on only one country. Some of these books are scholarly studies, but unfortunately, too many of them are eclectic collections of memoirs, lacking any system or method. Research on Hashomer Hatza'ir in England, France, Italy and many other countries is still lacking.

Yuval Dror

The Educational Method of Hashomer Hatza'ir in the Youth Movement and Formal Education

The educational method employed by Hashomer Hatza'ir was unique in its combination of an informal youth movement with formal schooling. The Hashomer Hatza'ir European Jewish youth movement was established in 1913, "emigrated" to Palestine and established the Hakibbutz Ha'artzi movement of Hashomer Hatza'ir. This kibbutz movement adopted the educational method of its youth movement and institutionalized it in its schools. This article is based on a systematic review of numerous studies. It first discusses the five main principles of the educational method of Hashomer Hatza'ir in its formative years (1913–29). The method subsequently developed along two parallel paths: the Hashomer Hatza'ir youth movement in Palestine and the State of Israel, from 1929 until the founding of the "Graduate Movement" of Hashomer Hatza'ir in 2003 and its educational and communitarian activities; and the formal and informal education in the schools of Hakibbutz Ha'artzi — from the elementary schools on the kibbutzim and the residential secondary boarding schools to the large regional schools run jointly by all kinds of settlements in recent decades. The article concludes that the educational method of Hashomer Hatza'ir, which still exists, was and is mainly successful, having managed to adapt its main principles to the changing times and circumstances.

Ronit Carmeli

Between Faith and Doubt, West and East: The Hashomer Hatza'ir Youth Movement's Identification with the Soviet Union in the 1950s and 1960s

The identification with the Soviet Union, which was one of the main ideological pillars of the Hashomer Hatza'ir youth movement, encountered grave difficulties from the 1930s. In the 1950s and the 1960s, young members were confronted with a conflict between facts and faith, until their painful disillusionment during the Six-Day War. In the 1960s confusion and uncertainty prevailed. In reaction, the youth turned away from ideological proclamations but continued to cling to old values like communal living, austerity and opposition to urban and Western culture. They shifted their attention from ideology to its practical manifestations, the kibbutz and its values, culture and lifestyle. The inter-bloc confrontation during the Cold War was at the focus of their political interest, and they continued to sympathize with the Soviet Union and criticize the United States. Opposition to the United States was a central part of their rejection of Western, urban culture and adherence to equality and communality.

Muki Tsur

Martin Buber and Hashomer Hatza'ir

The article seeks to trace the complex relations between Hashomer Hatza'ir's members and Martin Buber. Although Buber was not a member of Hashomer Hatza'ir movement, his speeches and articles had an enormous influence on the movement's ideological path. Buber's view of the Jewish world in general, and the Hasidic world in particular, his concept of human improvement and world improvement, his dialogical approach to "I-Thou" relations, his attitude toward the "Arab question" and his notion of togetherness, all became basic concepts that nourished the intellectual world of Hashomer Hatza'ir. The article examines the dialog between Buber and Hashomer Hatza'ir members during different periods. It demonstrates that although Buber was a kind of intellectual mentor, there was also a continuing tension between him and Hashomer Hatza'ir's members due to the movement's adherence to Marxism and its demand for the practical realization of its ideology and personal example.

Eli Tzur

Voices from Afar: Emissaries from Palestine to the Polish Hashomer Hatza'ir

The Hashomer Hatza'ir youth movement was a Zionist organization which educated its members for settling in Palestine, and from 1927 for joining the

kibbutz movement. Emissaries from the kibbutz movement in Palestine served as links with the youth movement in the diaspora. Their task was to present kibbutz life to the youth in the diaspora and create human reserves for the kibbutzim. The article describes the difficulties faced by three emissaries to Poland: Eliezer Peri, who almost dismantled the movement in Galicia in his struggle against the leftist opposition he encountered; Tzvi Lurie, who sought to subject the diaspora to the rule of the movement in Palestine; and Moshe Chizik (Calif), who witnessed the last days of the Polish movement.

Einat Nachmias

What Did We Talk about during the War?
Revelation and Concealment in the Discourse of the German
Youth Group in Kibbutz Ma'abarot

In 1939, 30 boys and girls, members of the German Youth Society, arrived in Palestine via Youth Aliyah. Most of them were members of the Hashomer Hatza'ir youth movement, and they were sent to Kibbutz Ma'abarot, which was affiliated with Hashomer Hatza'ir. The group conducted discussions on such topics as communal living and gender roles, which were recorded in Hebrew protocols. Together with the group's newspapers, these discussions reveal the questions, dilemmas and hardships that shaped their individual and collective identity. The article focuses on their experience of immigration and kibbutz life, after having suffered exclusion and hardship under Nazi rule as adolescents, and how these experiences affected their identity. Using later testimonies and interviews, the article also sheds light on what was not talked about in those formative years.

Ruth Braude

“Tashkent the City of Bread”: The Polish Hashomer Hatza'ir in
Central Asia, 1941-1945

During the German invasion of the Soviet Union, about four hundred members of Hashomer Hatza'ir, mostly from Vilnius, fled to the Soviet Union. After some time on a kolkhoz, they made the arduous journey to Tashkent, capital of the Uzbek Republic, in the hope of being able to reach Palestine by way of Afghanistan or Iran. These efforts failed, leading to the death of some and long-term imprisonment for others in gulags. In spite of Soviet restrictions, the movement succeeded in creating an illegal framework of voluntary cooperatives and communities of mutual assistance. While Hakibbutz Ha'artzi, the kibbutz movement affiliated with Hashomer Hatza'ir, adopted the Marxist class struggle, they cultivated a vision of an egalitarian commune in Palestine. The 1944 Soviet

occupation of Poland enabled them to flee Stalinist terror by returning to Poland, and from there to depart for Palestine.

Avihu Ronen

Two Avant-Garde Concepts: Hashomer Hatzá'ir in Poland and Hungary during the Holocaust

The article seeks to explain why Hashomer Hatzá'ir members in Poland were among the leaders of the Warsaw Ghetto uprising during the Holocaust, opposing any possible attempt at rescue, while, during the same period, the leaders of Hashomer Hatzá'ir in Hungary led rescue operations, preferring them to armed resistance. It suggests that this difference can be explained by means of the concept of the revolutionary avant-garde, which was one of the cornerstones of Hashomer Hatzá'ir ideology. Confronted with the systematic annihilation of the Jews, Hashomer Hatzá'ir members in Poland saw the avant-garde as the group who would show their people how to die with honor. In Hungary, where there were possibilities of going into hiding or being smuggled across the borders, among others, the leaders of Hashomer Hatzá'ir interpreted the function of the avant-garde as rescuing the Jewish people, in anticipation of its survival and recovery after the war.

Alon Pauker and Tamar Shechter

Hakibbutz Ha'artzi in the First Decade of the State of Israel: Between Fulfilling a Mission and Building a Home

The transition from the pre-state Yishuv to national state institutions, alongside the demographic, sociological and cultural transformations that occurred in the first decade of the State of Israel, changed the face of Israeli society and also affected the pioneering kibbutz movement, including the members of Hakibbutz Ha'artzi. The article analyzes the desire of Hakibbutz Ha'artzi members to concentrate their energies on the kibbutz as a home in opposition to their leaders who preferred to continue focusing on pioneering activity in order to preserve the movement's reputation from the Yishuv period. In particular, the article discusses the influence of the women members of the kibbutz on its life and social norms. It also describes the changes that took place in the Hakibbutz Ha'artzi youth movement, Hashomer Hatzá'ir, which faced the same challenges of new mindsets in the first years of the State of Israel.

Ofer Boord

“Everything will be returned to its place”: Hakibbutz Ha’artzi and the Reparations Agreement

The decision to uphold the Reparations Agreement between Israel and West Germany, signed in Luxembourg on September 10, 1952, was difficult for Hakibbutz Ha’artzi, as well as for the kibbutz movement as a whole. It was accompanied by political, ideological, and social struggles. Hakibbutz Ha’artzi was concerned not only that the Reparations Agreement might lead to exoneration of Germany and oblivion of the Nazi crimes, but also that it might pose a threat to the values of cooperation and equality as a result of the payments resulting from the personal compensation and the restitution from Germany. This article reviews the process of receiving the reparations, the personal compensation, and the restitution from Germany in Hakibbutz Ha’artzi and examines its various economic and social implications.

Tal Elmaliach

The Legacy of the Hashomer Hatza’ir Youth Movement in Hakibbutz Ha’artzi and Mapam

This article claims that the legacy of the Hashomer Hatza’ir youth movement was an ethos, which was based on two formative principles: the group and the *madrikh* (guide/instructor). This ethos was manifested in a pattern of thought and action which maintained an inherent separation between the inside and the outside, or “us” and “them”, between the graduates of the youth movement and their social and political environment. A leading role in fostering this ethos was performed by the *madrikh*, who mediated between the members and reality, and reinforced this separation. The “separation ethos,” which was realized in various ways, had contradictory influences on Hakibbutz Ha’artzi and Mapam. It turned them into socially cohesive, independent bodies and enhanced their ability to act, but also limited their development, prevented a change in leadership, and focused their attention on preserving their boundaries. The legacy of the youth movement was therefore a significant factor both in the development of these organizations and in their decline.

Shula Keshet

Literature as an Ideological Tool: The Case for Socialist Realism in the Hashomer Hatzza'ir Weekly, 1931-1943

The article describes the complex relations between literature, culture and ideology as reflected in the ideological weekly *Hashomer Hatzza'ir*, in the period between 1931 and 1943. The magazine later became the daily paper of Mapam, *Al Hamishmar*. During the 1930s the literary sections of the magazine were dominated by a small group of critics, most of them members of Kibbutz Ein Shemer, who maintained a strong loyalty to Marxist and even Soviet traditions, based on the teachings of Georg Lukács. Through a reading of the literary sections and theater reviews in the magazine, the article seeks to trace areas of conflict and contradictions indicating the complexity of the ideological expectations from literature. Only in 1939, when Avraham Shlonsky, joined the magazine, together with a young group of writers and poets, did the Marxist tendency change, and the magazine, and later on the daily paper, become an important tool for addressing the general public.

Yael Darr

The Avant-Garde of the Young Guard: Two Competing Pioneering Models in Hashomer Hatzza'ir Children's Literature

The article examines the secret of the success of the Sifriat Po'alim publishing house in the 1940s and 1950s—the period in which it dictated the hegemonic literary taste in child culture. It argues that during these years the children's literature published by Sifriat Po'alim manifested an unresolved inner tension created by two competing models of the avant-garde: on the one hand, collectivist pioneering education, which advocated the principles of anti-bourgeois communal childrearing, and, on the other hand, a literary (modernist) avant-garde for children, which promoted poetic innovation and universalism. Thus, in addition to the literature designed to educate the younger generation to follow in the revolutionary footsteps of the founding fathers, children were offered fresh and provocative literary works that emphasized aesthetic and universal values and demanded critical readings. An analysis of literary texts and correspondence found in Sifriat Po'alim's archives reveals that the dispute over the models of kibbutz avant-garde literature for children took place between two competing groups of trendsetters: kibbutz educators and modernist literati who were associated with the movement, but were not kibbutz members. David Hanegbi, the editor in chief, recognized the importance of the different pioneering voices and mediated between the two sides.

Natan Shahar
Communal Singing and Repertoire in Hashomer Hatza'ir

Communal singing, one of the central activities of the Hashomer Hatza'ir youth movement, is simultaneously a social, educational and cultural activity. Its importance can be explained by the way in which communal singing combines "cooperation" with "equality," elements that constitute not only the musical foundation of communal singing but also the two most substantive social foundations of the Hashomer Hatza'ir youth movement. This article describes communal singing as it was practiced in most movement activities, in local branches and elsewhere, in both rural settlements and cities. The songs referred to in the article form a representative sample of the larger repertoire that developed from 1918 through 1983.